IMPLEMENTATION REPORT FOR THE EUROPEAN TERRITORIAL COOPERATION GOAL

PART A

IDENTIFICATION OF THE ANNUAL/FINAL IMPLEMENTATION REPORT

CCI	2014TC16RFTN006
Title	North West Europe
Version	2015.0
Date of approval of the report by the monitoring committee	25-May-2016

2. OVERVIEW OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(3)(A) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)

Key information on the implementation of the cooperation programme for the year concerned, including on financial instruments, with relation to the financial and indicator data.

The year 2015 was a critical one to the Programme, as the 2007-2013 IVB Programme transitioned towards the 2014 - 2020 VB NWE. This necessitated a parallel closure of the IVB Programme and the launch of the new VB NWE. Despite this challenge and the late approval of the new Programme by the European Commission (18th June 2015), the Programme authorities decided to launch the first call for proposals in April 2015, prior to the official approval date. This decision was justified by the fact that further delays of calls would affect the Programme performance and its project pipeline in the long term.

The first NWE call for proposals was launched on 7th April 2015 and closed on 18th May 2015. The call was relevant to all 3 Programme Priorities, therefore the five Specific Objectives of NWE. No specific budgetary limitations were set by the Monitoring Committee for the first call. The eligibility and quality assessment criteria were agreed by the Programme Preparatory Group prior to the official Programme approval. The application pack included the Application Form available in the electronic Monitoring System of the Programme (eMS) and the first version of the Programme Manual.

The two step application process introduced by the Programme for the VB period was welcome by the applicants. It focuses on an application form submitted at the Step 1, which embraces the project concept, expected results and long-term effects as well as a partnership structure. The Step 1 concept notes are developed by the partnerships together with the Programme Contact Points and are less time consuming for the applicants hence alleviate the administrative burden for the applicants. The bids that are approved in Step 1 get full support from the officers of the Joint Secretariat to develop a full work plan that fulfils the Programme eligibility and quality requirements in Step 2 of the application process. The degree of support provided by the Contact Points and JS officers is therefore considered high. In the future the projects might benefit from parallel support provided by the JS and the Contact Points as the division of responsibilities between the Contact Points and JS officers in the application process is being monitored in order to find the optimal model.

The two-step process attracted a high number of applications and involved newcomers to the Programme. In addition, the applicants were, in general, satisfied with the new electronic submission system via the Programme eMS (electronic Monitoring System). In line with the Cooperation Programme and the Programme Communication Strategy, the Technical Assistance work plan 2015 and 2016 have both set the involvement of new stakeholders and the outreach to peripheral areas and weaker performing regions as priorities. Specific efforts have therefore been made to make the information on the Programme as available and easily accessible as possible, notably through the development of new communication tools. Launched in December 2015, the NWE

website in particular includes tools to facilitate the understanding of our programme (a video and an infographic simplifying the application process).

Out of the 82 submitted applications submitted in Call 1 Step 1, 5 did not meet the eligibility criteria. Consequently 77 underwent the follow-up quality assessment process. The Monitoring Committee met on 9th and 10th July 2015 and approved 19 of them at the Step 1 of the application process. The approved projects were most promising in terms of results and change on the Programme territory, had the highest potential in terms of long-term effects and entailed a high-level of transnational co-operation. They also represented the highest value for money of all submitted projects.

The Programme recommendations for further improvement were included in the official Step 1 notification letters, to ensure that the quality of Step 2 bids meets the Programme requirements. They related to areas such as co-operation intensity, partnership quality, long-term effects, value for money, work plan, budget and risk management, applied to all 19 approved projects. Each project also had an action plan developed by the JS and the CP network to ensure that these requirements are met by the beneficiaries. The deadline for Step 2 submission was 31st December 2015.15 partnerships submitted their proposals while the remaining 4 decided to wait till the next call (which is in line with the Programme rules) to improve their projects to the required standard and submit in Step 2 of the Call 2 (June 2016).

The Programme Communication Strategy was approved at the first Monitoring Committee meeting in Liege. In line with the strategy, several Programme events were organised. Apart from the Project Idea lab that took place prior to the launch of call 1 (17th March 2015), the Programme organised additional three events in autumn 2015, separate per Priority. The Innovation Lab (6th October, Birmingham, UK) as well as the Low Carbon (15th October, Leuven, Belgium) and Resource Efficiency (30th September, Rennes, France) events focused on the challenges in NWE specific to the three Programme priorities, match-making for partners as well as the explanation of the application process. Examples NWE IVB projects that were relevant to the VB thematic coverage were also provided. The events reached out to a large number of people (306 participants, of which 64% newcomers)
and were deliberately organised in regions less represented in the IVB Programme.

The second call for proposals of the NWE Programme (Step 1) closed on 30 November 2015 at noon. In total, the JS received 86 applications. As the assessment process finished in January 2016 only, the results of this step of the Call 2 will be reported next year. However, it should be noted that 7 were declared ineligible; 79 projects were therefore assessed against the set of Quality Criteria. Among the 86 submissions, approximately 17 applications appeared to be resubmissions from Call 1 or follow-ups from NWE IVB projects. In general, most applicants understood the intention of Step 1, which was a clear improvement compared to the first call. The need to provide baselines, describe trends and quantify targets seemed to be better understood as well.

As the projects submitted in call 1 were only approved by the third Monitoring Committee of the Programme, which took place in February 2016 in Dusseldorf, no projects were fully approved by the end of 2015. This implies that, even though the overall budget allocation requested by beneficiaries in 2015 amounted to 88,627,790 EUR of Total Eligible Cost, no projects were officially approved in 2015 and hence no

contribution towards the Programme indicator framework or key implementation steps (number of projects approved) can be declared in this report.

The next Annual Implementation Report, together with the “Citizen’s Summary” will be provided by 31st May 2017 at the latest.

3. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PRIORITY AXIS

3.1 Overview of the implementation

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
1	INNOVATION	36 projects were submitted in the first call for proposals under Priority 1, covering Specific Objective 1 of the Programme. 8 projects were approved in the Step 1 by the Monitoring Committee and hence qualified for the Step 2 of the application process. The thematic scope of submitted projects was quite wide, ranging from life science and health innovation (e.g. oncology, mental health, medical products), agro-food industry and bio-innovation support, open social innovation to the establishment of various types of innovation networks. Several weaknesses of bids were noted by the Programme. Many of the submitted projects presented generic ideas to foster competitiveness or innovation, without a specific challenge, target group, topic or sector being addressed. However, they tackled the territorial challenges relevant to the Regional Innovation Scoreboard and consequently applied the innovation leader-follower approach. The identification of market failure to prove the additionality of the funding allocation and the quantification of the project results on the Programme territory were also problematic. This led to a low approval rate in Step 1 of the application process. The result-orientation workshop in Ghent (November 2015) brought some further insight into the call 1 findings and helped harmonise messages for project improvements before the launch of the Step 2 of the call. The main recommendations of the workshop related to the improvement of the Programme wide understanding of the innovation priority, with particular focus on the scope of social innovation. The quality of the bids submitted in Step 2 improved, although. not all projects implemented the Programme recommendations provided by the first MC.

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
2	LOW CARBON	In total, 29 applications were received under this Priority in Step 1 of the Call 1. The spread across the 3 Specific Objectives covered by Priority 2 was fairly reasonable, with 11 projects submitted under Specific Objective 2, 6 under Specific Objective 3 and 12 under Specific Objective 4. The quality of the submitted bids was higher than in the remaining two Programme priorities, although the projects submitted under SO4 were broad in their scope and lacked focus. Out of the 8 projects approved by the Monitoring Committee for Step 2, two opted to postpone their submission to call 3 in order to have enough time to consider and implement all Programme requirements (TIDAL, EMPOWER). Under SO2, the applicant mix was public sector in composition (SO2) focusing on the implementation of low-carbon/energy-efficient solutions via participatory processes, new financing mechanisms and governance models. Energy-efficient water management, development of hydrogen economy, renewable energy applications and technologies were also thematically covered. As for SO3, the partners were mainly private or research organisations (13 enterprises including 8 SMEs, 9 higher education/research organisations). The topics covered by the projects ranged from testing new ocean/tidal technologies, testing energy storage technologies, energy generation from organic waste, waste and residue valorisation and refurbishment of public buildings. The range of topics covered by the projects submitted under SO4 was wide, from cycling infrastructure, via last-mile or greener logistics to hydrogen vehicles. The partnerships consisted mainly of public authorities (58 - national/regional and local) and the private sector (17 companies, including 7 SMEs).
3	RESOURCE AND MATERIALS	The first call for proposals attracted 15 applications under Priority 3 of the Programme, all of

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
	EFFICIENCY	them being eligible. The range of projects submitted addressed the link between the resources (fossil fuels, materials and minerals, water, land, soil and waste) and resource intensive sectors (mainly agro-food production and constructions). Their main goal was the recycling nutrients such as Nitrogen, Phosphorus or Potassium as well as construction materials or buildings via the implementation of new technologies, product, services or processes. Nevertheless, the relevance of the submitted projects to the Specific Objective 5 was weak. The bidding partnerships struggled to define the challenge for their projects to tackle and hence had difficulties with the identification of the project result, its baseline and target values. It must be noted that the bidding partnerships were consistent with those required under the Specific Objective 5 of the Programme. Long-term effects and value for money criteria were difficult to assess due to the unclear or multi-focused objectives. Consequently, only 3 projects were approved by the Monitoring Committee at Step 1. Only one of them, submitted their proposal in the Step 2 of the application process (ARBOR II). The remaining two (NuCy and RESOLV) decided to submit their final proposals in Step 2 of the Call 2, to allow enough time for project development. Step 1 of the call 2 for the Programme resulted in 19 applications submitted under Priority 3 of the Programme. As the assessment process continued into January 2016, it will be reported in the next period due to greater relevance.
4	TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	The year 2014 was mainly dedicated to the establishment of stronger links between the JTS, MA and the Member States in the course of preparation of the VB NWE Programme. 8 meetings of

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
		the Programme Preparatory Group (PPG) combining all Members States took place throughout the year in Brussels and London. They mainly focused on the formulation and fine-tuning of the actual text of the Cooperation Programme and the two-step application process based on the recommendations provided in an evaluation study delivered in 2012 (the project development and selection procedures, SQW). The budget grant rate, the application process, eligibility and quality selection criteria as well as audit and control were also discussed. In addition, the Programme was actively involved in the electronic Monitoring System group (eMS) set up by INTERACT. The system enables the monitoring of projects and Programme implementation as well as electronic exchange of data between programmes and beneficiaries. The system will be used by more than 20 ETC programmes to facilitate their operations in 2014 - 2020. Last but not least, apart from the two Monitoring Committee meetings focusing on the Programme calls for Proposals already mentioned (first and third MCs), the Programme also organised an additional Committee meeting on 18th November 2015. This Committee concentrated on the internal procedures of the Programme and dealt with issues such as State Aid, Rules of Procedure and the Designation Procedure. The MC also agreed that the terms of reference for call 3 of the Programme will integrate the issue of recognised refugees in the mid and long term, in particular in the domain of entrepreneurship, employment and access to the labour market.

3.2 Common and programme specific indicators (Article 50(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Priority axes other than technical assistance

Priority axis	1 - INNOVATION
Investment priority	1b - Promoting business investment in R&I, developing links and synergies between enterprises, research and development centres and the higher education sector, in particular promoting investment in product and service development, technology transfer, social innovation, eco-innovation, public service applications, demand stimulation, networking, clusters and open innovation through smart specialisation, and supporting technological and applied research, pilot lines, early product validation actions, advanced manufacturing capabilities and first production, in particular in key enabling technologies and diffusion of general purpose technologies

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	540.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	540.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	540.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	540.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	340.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	340.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	1.01	Number of new or enhanced transnational clusters or innovation networks	No. of clusters and innovation networks	27.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	1.01	Number of new or enhanced transnational clusters or innovation networks	No. of clusters and innovation networks	27.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	1.02	Number of technologies, products, services and processes developed and tested in real life conditions	No. of solutions tested	68.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	1.02	Number of technologies, products, services and processes developed and tested in real life conditions	No. of solutions tested	68.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	1.03	Number of pilot actions implemented, focusing on social innovation	No. of actions	30.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	1.03	Number of pilot actions implemented, focusing on social innovation	No. of actions	30.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	1.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	860.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	1.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	860.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	1.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	860.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	1.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	860.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	1.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project (in €)	EUR	222,000,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
S	1.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project (in €)	EUR	222,000,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	1.07	Number of end-users benefitting from social innovation	No. of end-users	600.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	1.07	Number of end-users benefitting from social innovation	No. of end-users	600.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
F	1.01	Number of new or enhanced transnational clusters or innovation networks	0.00

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
S	1.01	Number of new or enhanced transnational clusters or innovation networks	0.00
F	1.02	Number of technologies, products, services and processes developed and tested in real life conditions	0.00
S	1.02	Number of technologies, products, services and processes developed and tested in real life conditions	0.00
F	1.03	Number of pilot actions implemented, focusing on social innovation	0.00
S	1.03	Number of pilot actions implemented, focusing on social innovation	0.00
F	1.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
S	1.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
F	1.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
S	1.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
F	1.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project (in €)	0.00
S	1.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project (in €)	0.00
F	1.07	Number of end-users benefitting from social innovation	0.00
S	1.07	Number of end-users benefitting from social innovation	0.00

Priority axis	1 - INNOVATION
Investment priority	1b - Promoting business investment in R&I, developing links and synergies between enterprises, research and development centres and the higher education sector, in particular promoting investment in product and service development, technology transfer, social innovation, eco-innovation, public service applications, demand stimulation, networking, clusters and open innovation through smart specialisation, and supporting technological and applied research, pilot lines, early product validation actions, advanced manufacturing capabilities and first production, in particular in key enabling technologies and diffusion of general purpose technologies
Specific objective	SO1 - To enhance innovation performance of enterprises throughout NWE regions

Table 1: Result indicators

	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	Observations
R1	Degree of SME involvement in collaboration with other institutions (including R&D)	Percentage	15.00	2014	20.00	0.00		

ID	**Indicator**	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
R1	Degree of SME involvement in collaboration with other institutions (including R&D)	0.00	

Priority axis	2 - LOW CARBON
Investment priority	4e - Promoting low-carbon strategies for all types of territories, in particular for urban areas, including the promotion of sustainable multimodal urban mobility and mitigation-relevant adaptation measures

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
F	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	450.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	450.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO32	Energy efficiency: Decrease of annual primary energy consumption of public buildings	kWh/year	300,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO32	Energy efficiency: Decrease of annual primary energy consumption of public buildings	kWh/year	300,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	450.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	450.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	2.01	Number of solutions facilitating the delivery of existing or emerging low-carbon, energy or climate-protection strategies	No. of solutions	18.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	2.01	Number of solutions facilitating the delivery of existing or emerging low-carbon, energy or	No. of solutions	18.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
		climate-protection strategies				
F	2.02	Number of combined mitigation-relevant adaptation solutions implemented	No. of solutions	15.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	2.02	Number of combined mitigation-relevant adaptation solutions implemented	No. of solutions	15.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	2.03	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	2.03	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	2.04	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectorsNumber of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	2.04	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectorsNumber of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	2.05	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	80,811,405.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	2.05	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	80,811,405.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
F	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	0.00
S	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	0.00
F	CO32	Energy efficiency: Decrease of annual primary energy consumption of public buildings	0.00
S	CO32	Energy efficiency: Decrease of annual primary energy consumption of public buildings	0.00
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00
F	2.01	Number of solutions facilitating the delivery of existing or emerging low-carbon, energy or climate-protection strategies	0.00
S	2.01	Number of solutions facilitating the delivery of existing or emerging low-carbon, energy or climate-protection strategies	0.00
F	2.02	Number of combined mitigation-relevant adaptation solutions implemented	0.00
S	2.02	Number of combined mitigation-relevant adaptation solutions implemented	0.00
F	2.03	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
S	2.03	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
F	2.04	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectorsNumber of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
S	2.04	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectorsNumber of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
F	2.05	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00
S	2.05	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00

Priority axis	2 - LOW CARBON
Investment priority	4e - Promoting low-carbon strategies for all types of territories, in particular for urban areas, including the promotion of sustainable multimodal urban mobility and mitigation-relevant adaptation measures
Specific objective	SO2 - To facilitate the implementation of low-carbon, energy and climate protection strategies to reduce GHG emissions in NWE

Table 1: Result indicators

	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	Observations
R2	Effectiveness of the NWE public sector organisations in the implementation of low carbon strategies	Percentage	31.00	2014	18.00	0.00		Given the negative annual growth rate of -15% and the estimate of 9% for 2022, the Programme target value will double the 2022 estimate. Please see the Programme methodology for result indicators provided as an attachment to this report.

ID	**Indicator**	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
R2	Effectiveness of the NWE public sector organisations in the implementation of low carbon strategies	0.00	

Priority axis	2 - LOW CARBON
Investment priority	4f - Promoting research and innovation in, and adoption of, low-carbon technologies

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable energy production	MW	120.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable	MW	120.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
		energy production				
F	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	660.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	660.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	500.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	500.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	3.01	Number of adopted or applied low carbon technologies	Number of adopted or applied low carbon technologies	44.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	3.01	Number of adopted or applied low carbon technologies	Number of adopted or applied low carbon technologies	44.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	3.02	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	3.02	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	3.03	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	3.03	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	220.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	3.04	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	87,545,688.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	3.04	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	87,545,688.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
F	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable energy production	0.00
S	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable energy production	0.00
F	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	0.00
S	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	0.00
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00
F	3.01	Number of adopted or applied low carbon technologies	0.00
S	3.01	Number of adopted or applied low carbon technologies	0.00
F	3.02	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
S	3.02	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
F	3.03	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
S	3.03	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
F	3.04	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00
S	3.04	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00

Priority axis	2 - LOW CARBON
Investment priority	4f - Promoting research and innovation in, and adoption of, low-carbon technologies
Specific objective	SO3 - To facilitate the uptake of low carbon technologies, products, processes and services in sectors with high energy saving potential, to reduce GHG emissions in NWE

Table 1: Result indicators

	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	Observations
R3	Status of conditions for low carbon technology deployment in NWE	Percentage	60.00	2014	70.00	0.00		

ID	**Indicator**	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
R3	Status of conditions for low carbon technology deployment in NWE	0.00	

Priority axis	2 - LOW CARBON
Investment priority	7c - Developing and improving environmentally-friendly (including low noise) and low-carbon transport systems, including inland waterways and maritime transport, ports, multimodal links and airport infrastructure, in order to promote sustainable regional and local mobility

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	500.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	500.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	4.01	Number of implemented low carbon solutions in transport	No. of solutions	20.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	4.01	Number of implemented low carbon solutions in transport	No. of solutions	20.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	4.02	Number of new or improved transport management systems leading to GHG reduction	No. of systems	10.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	4.02	Number of new or improved transport management systems leading to GHG reduction	No. of systems	10.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	4.03	Number of transport operators supported implementing low carbon solutions	No. of transport operators	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	4.03	Number of transport operators supported implementing low carbon solutions	No. of transport operators	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	4.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	4.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	4.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	4.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	4.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	80,811,405.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	4.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	80,811,405.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00
F	4.01	Number of implemented low carbon solutions in transport	0.00
S	4.01	Number of implemented low carbon solutions in transport	0.00
F	4.02	Number of new or improved transport management systems leading to GHG reduction	0.00
S	4.02	Number of new or improved transport management systems leading to GHG reduction	0.00
F	4.03	Number of transport operators supported implementing low carbon solutions	0.00
S	4.03	Number of transport operators supported	0.00

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
		implementing low carbon solutions	
F	4.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
S	4.04	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
F	4.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
S	4.05	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
F	4.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00
S	4.06	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00

Priority axis	2 - LOW CARBON
Investment priority	7c - Developing and improving environmentally-friendly (including low noise) and low-carbon transport systems, including inland waterways and maritime transport, ports, multimodal links and airport infrastructure, in order to promote sustainable regional and local mobility
Specific objective	SO4 - To facilitate the implementation of transnational low-carbon solutions in transport systems to reduce GHG emissions in NWE

Table 1: Result indicators

	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	Observations
R4	Status of competences of the transport sector in the use of low carbon solutions in the transport systems	Percentage	6.00	2014	15.00	0.00		

ID	**Indicator**	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
R4	Status of competences of the transport sector in the use of low carbon solutions in the transport systems	0.00	

Priority axis	3 - RESOURCE AND MATERIALS EFFICIENCY
Investment priority	6f - Promoting innovative technologies to improve environmental protection and resource efficiency in the waste sector, water sector and with regard to soil, or to reduce air pollution

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	200.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	5.01	Number of efficient natural and material resources solutions implemented and tested	No. of solutions implemented	42.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	5.01	Number of efficient natural and material resources solutions implemented and tested	No. of solutions implemented	42.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	5.02	Number of innovative uses of waste processes/products/services from waste materials	No. of solutions designed	18.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	5.02	Number of innovative uses of waste processes/products/services from waste materials	No. of solutions designed	18.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	5.03	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	161,622,811.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	5.03	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	EUR	161,622,811.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	5.04	Amount of decreased raw material use	Tonnes	1,000,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	5.04	Amount of decreased raw material use	Tonnes	1,000,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	5.05	Amount of increased material recovery, re-use and recycling	Tonnes	1,000,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	5.05	Amount of increased material recovery, re-use and recycling	Tonnes	1,000,000.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	5.06	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	400.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	5.06	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	400.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
F	5.07	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	400.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period
S	5.07	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	No. of jobs	400.00	0.00	No projects were fully approved by the Programme in this period

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00
F	5.01	Number of efficient natural and material resources solutions implemented and tested	0.00
S	5.01	Number of efficient natural and material resources solutions implemented and tested	0.00
F	5.02	Number of innovative uses of waste processes/products/services from waste materials	0.00
S	5.02	Number of innovative uses of waste processes/products/services from waste materials	0.00
F	5.03	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
S	5.03	Amount of funding leveraged by the project	0.00
F	5.04	Amount of decreased raw material use	0.00
S	5.04	Amount of decreased raw material use	0.00
F	5.05	Amount of increased material recovery, re-use and recycling	0.00
S	5.05	Amount of increased material recovery, re-use and recycling	0.00
F	5.06	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
S	5.06	Number of jobs created in all economic sectors	0.00
F	5.07	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00
S	5.07	Number of jobs maintained in all economic sectors	0.00

Priority axis	3 - RESOURCE AND MATERIALS EFFICIENCY
Investment priority	6f - Promoting innovative technologies to improve environmental protection and resource efficiency in the waste sector, water sector and with regard to soil, or to reduce air pollution
Specific objective	SO5 - To optimise (re)use of material and natural resources in NWE

Table 1: Result indicators

	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	Observations
R5	Status of competences in the resource intensive sectors in NWE for eco-innovation diffusion	Percentage	110.00	2014	112.00	0.00		The baseline and target values represent 110% and 112% of the EU average respectively. Please see the Programme methodology for result indicators provided as an attachment to this report.

ID	**Indicator**	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
R5	Status of competences in the resource intensive sectors in NWE for eco-innovation diffusion	0.00	

Priority axes for technical assistance

Priority axis	4 - TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
F	6.01	Number of Transnational Cooperation projects approved	Number		0.00	Due to the two-step approach, no projects were officially approved in 2015.
S	6.01	Number of Transnational Cooperation projects approved	Number		0.00	Due to the two-step approach, no projects were officially approved in 2015.
F	6.02	Number of on the spot verifications (site visits) done by JS staff	Number		0.00	
S	6.02	Number of on the spot verifications (site visits) done by JS staff	Number		0.00	
F	6.03	Average number of visits to the Programme website	Number/month		0.00	
S	6.03	Average number of visits to the Programme website	Number/month		0.00	
F	6.04	Number of Monitoring Committee meetings	Number		2.00	Monitoring Committee 1, 9-10th July, Liege, Belgium; Monitoring Committee 2, 17-18 November 2015, Ghent, Belgium.
S	6.04	Number of Monitoring Committee meetings	Number		2.00	Monitoring Committee 1, 9-10th July, Liege, Belgium; Monitoring Committee 2, 17-18 November 2015, Ghent, Belgium.

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2015	Observations
F	6.05	Duration of reimbursement of expenditure to final beneficiaries	Weeks		0.00	
S	6.05	Duration of reimbursement of expenditure to final beneficiaries	Weeks		0.00	
F	6.06	Number of appeals to calls for proposals	Number		1.00	The complaint against the declaration of ineligibility of the Vital Cities project (ViCi) was received by the JS on 5th June 2015
S	6.06	Number of appeals to calls for proposals	Number		1.00	The complaint against the declaration of ineligibility of the Vital Cities project (ViCi) was received by the JS on 5th June 2015
F	6.07	Number of evaluations, studies, surveys, experts, reports	Number		0.00	
S	6.07	Number of evaluations, studies, surveys, experts, reports	Number		0.00	
F	6.08	Number of employees whose salaries are co-financed by Technical Assistance	Number		22.88	
S	6.08	Number of employees whose salaries are co-financed by Technical Assistance	Number		22.88	
F	6.09	Staff turn-over	Percentage		13.90	
S	6.09	Staff turn-over	Percentage		13.90	

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
F	6.01	Number of Transnational Cooperation projects approved	0.00
S	6.01	Number of Transnational Cooperation projects approved	0.00
F	6.02	Number of on the spot verifications (site visits) done by JS staff	0.00
S	6.02	Number of on the spot verifications (site visits) done by JS staff	0.00

(1)	ID	Indicator	2014
F	6.03	Average number of visits to the Programme website	0.00
S	6.03	Average number of visits to the Programme website	0.00
F	6.04	Number of Monitoring Committee meetings	0.00
S	6.04	Number of Monitoring Committee meetings	0.00
F	6.05	Duration of reimbursement of expenditure to final beneficiaries	0.00
S	6.05	Duration of reimbursement of expenditure to final beneficiaries	0.00
F	6.06	Number of appeals to calls for proposals	0.00
S	6.06	Number of appeals to calls for proposals	0.00
F	6.07	Number of evaluations, studies, surveys, experts, reports	0.00
S	6.07	Number of evaluations, studies, surveys, experts, reports	0.00
F	6.08	Number of employees whose salaries are co-financed by Technical Assistance	20.08
S	6.08	Number of employees whose salaries are co-financed by Technical Assistance	20.08
F	6.09	Staff turn-over	0.00
S	6.09	Staff turn-over	0.00

Priority axis	4 - TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
Specific objective	SO6 - To maximise the effectiveness and efficiency of the management and implementation of the INTERREG NWE Programme

Table 1: Result indicators

	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	Observations
TA1	Share (%) of all supported operations that are implemented successfully, demonstrated by the achievement of planned objectives	Percentage	0.00	2013	90.00	0.00		
TA2	Percentage of satisfaction of supporting beneficiaries in the implementation and communication of their projects	Percentage	66.00	2014	76.00	0.00		
TA3	Amount of regular expenditure in sample for audit of operation	Percentage	0.00	2013	98.00	0.00		

ID	Indicator	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
TA1	Share (%) of all supported operations that are implemented successfully, demonstrated by the achievement of planned objectives	0.00	
TA2	Percentage of satisfaction of supporting beneficiaries in the implementation and communication of their projects	0.00	
TA3	Amount of regular expenditure in sample for audit of operation	0.00	

3.4. Financial data

Table 4: Financial information at priority axis and programme level

As set out in Table 1 of Annex II to Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) No 1011/2014 (Model for transmission of financial data) and table 16 of model for cooperation programmes under the European territorial cooperation goal

Priority axis	Fund	Calculation basis	Total funding	Co-financing rate	Total eligible cost of operations selected for support	Proportion of the total allocation covered with selected operations	Public eligible cost of operations selected for support	Total eligible expenditure declared by beneficiaries to the managing authority	Proportion of the total allocation covered by eligible expenditure declared by beneficiaries	Number of operations selected
1	ERDF	Total	217,873,890.00	60.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0
2	ERDF	Total	244,282,844.00	60.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0
3	ERDF	Total	158,453,737.00	60.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0
4	ERDF	Total	27,962,424.00	85.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0
Total	**ERDF**		**648,572,895.00**	**61.08**	**0.00**	**0.00%**	**0.00**	**0.00**	**0.00%**	**0**
Grand total			**648,572,895.00**	**61.08**	**0.00**	**0.00%**	**0.00**	**0.00**	**0.00%**	**0**

Where applicable, the use of any contribution from third countries participating in the cooperation programme should be provided (for example IPA and ENI, Norway, Switzerland)

Swiss organisations may participate in the NWE projects but are not entitled to ERDF funding. They may receive funding from the Swiss federal government to co-finance their share in the project budget, and in some cases, may need to provide own funding to cover their entire share of the project budget.

Table 5: Breakdown of the cumulative financial data by category of intervention

As set out in Table 2 of Annex II to Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) No 1011/2014 (Model for transmission of financial data) and tables 6-9 of Model for cooperation programmes

Priority axis	Fund	Intervention field	Form of finance	Territorial dimension	Territorial delivery mechanism	Thematic objective dimension	ESF secondary theme	Economic dimension	Location dimension	Total eligible cost of operations selected for support	Public eligible cost of operations selected for support	The total eligible expenditure declared by eneficiaries to the managing authority	Number of operations selected
1	ERDF												
2	ERDF												
3	ERDF												
4	ERDF												

Table 6: Cumulative cost of all or part of an operation implemented outside the Union part of the programme area

1. Operation (2)	2. The amount of ERDF support(1) envisaged to be used for all or part of an operation implemented outside the Union part of the programme area based on selected operations	3. Share of the total financial allocation to all or part of an operation located outside the Union part of the programme area (%) (column 2/total amount allocated to the support from the ERDF at programme level *100)	4. Eligible expenditure of ERDF support incurred in all or part of an operation implemented outside the Union part of the programme area declared by the beneficiary to the managing authority	5. Share of the total financial allocation to all or part of an operation located outside the Union part of the programme area (%) (column 4/total amount allocated to the support from the ERDF at programme level *100)
All or part of an operation outside the Union part of the programme area	0.00		0.00	

(1) ERDF support is the Commission decision on the respective cooperation programme.

(2) In accordance with and subject to ceilings set out Article 20 of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013.

4. SYNTHESIS OF THE EVALUATIONS

In line with the Art. 50 of the CPR regulation concerning the implementation reports, the actions taken to fulfill the ex-ante conditionalities not fulfilled at the moment of Programme adoption will be outlined in the report submitted in 2017.

5. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN

(a) Issues which affect the performance of the programme and the measures taken

A few horizontal problems were noted in the Call 1 of the Programme (Step 1) which affected the volume of the project pipeline to date. They were mainly related to the switch between the requirements of the NWE IVB and VB programmes and linked to the result orientation introduced in the new programming period:

- Although all of the project ideas reflected a degree of relevance to the Programme, the rationale of the two-step application process aiming to ensure the strategic fit of the projects into the Programme and their result-orientation was not understood by many applicants. The high number of application forms received was mainly due to the fact that the Programme introduced the reimbursement of preparation costs which acted as a financial incentive for partnerships to establish quickly and bid for funding in the first call.

- Many applicants did not understand the purpose of Step 1 of the application process and submitted full applications including unnecessary details like the project work plan or full partnerships required in the follow-up Step 2. These additionally provided elements were not assessed by the Programme (for instance the selection criteria attribute only 20% of the overall score to the partnership in Step 1).

- Applicants found it difficult to formulate the project results, which directly affected the value for money of the submitted projects as well as their long-term effects on the Programme territory and their durability.

- The need to quantify results and provide baselines and target values on the basis of existing trends was not fully understood. Consequently, this led to additional difficulties to assess the change that the projects will entail on the NWE territory and impact on the Programme target groups. Many applicants also struggled to understand the difference between a project result and output.

- The Programme also noted an overlap between the Specific Objectives 2, 3 and 5 of the Programme, hence the Priorities 2 and 3.

In addition, due to the late approval of the Programme, the guidance available to applicants was not fully ready and mainly based on the rules applicable in the previous 2007-2013 Programming period. This also affected the quality of the Step 1 applications received.

Some technical glitches should also be noted:

- Inconsistencies in the format of the Application Form appeared between the level of information requested and the aim of the Step 1 application process. For instance, too much information was requested concerning the project partners whereas only the

concept of the partnership was required. This was amended after the first Programme Monitoring Committee meeting and led to adjustments of the partnership section of the eMS Application Form. The wording of descriptions for the individual AF sections were adjusted. The work packages were also deleted from the AF, to ensure that applicants focus on the broader needs, challenges and results of the projects rather than their operational aspects. In conclusion, for call 2, the revised/reduced version of the Application Form reflects the aim of Step 1 much better. The fact that the contents of the Application Form that were initially meant to be frozen were allowed to be modified, will help refine the project results in Step 2 in particular. The Programme also produced new infographics to simplify the language used by the Programme as well as the required project intervention logic. The language used in the Programme Manual was simplified accordingly as well.

The first Monitoring Committee was followed by a workshop organised by the Programme on17th November 2015 in Ghent, Belgium with a sub-contractor SQW (UK), which delivered a mid-term evaluation of the NWE IVB Programme. Its aim was to gather the Member State delegates, National Contact Points and the Joint Secretariat to align the JS recommendations for project approvals with the MC decisions and ensure a common understanding of implications of the result-orientation. This was necessary due to the following reasons:

- The decision-making process in the 2014-2020 period is based on elements and criteria that vary greatly from those applied in the IVB Programme. In the previous programming period, the transnational cooperation was the key criterion, whereas now it is the project result that is the main element for decisions and has the highest weight in the project selection criteria. This led to varied perceptions of projects and required a common approach from all Programme authorities. The MC in Liege decided that more time needed to be given to the MSs to process and prepare for the call 1 assessments, which would impact on the decision-making rigour.

- The varied perception of the validity of Step 1 results proposed by the partnerships also brought difficulties. The results at Step 1 should be taken as indicative, rather than definitive. They are the first estimation of the project achievement profile and help assess the scope, scale and feasibility of the project at Step 1. The results proposed by the bidding partnerships only represent a commitment once redeveloped in Step 2. Results can be both tangible and intangible (and hence hard to quantify, e.g. behavioural change projects). The Programme should also be able to handle both by finding ways to combine quantification and qualification of such results.

- The content of the proposed projects should drive the partnership mix. The partners which were active in the NWE IVB Programme bring track record and proven expertise, whereas the newcomers bring innovation.

- Risks related to the involvement of private partners need to be assessed. Their involvement is required, but can be indirect; they do not need to be project partners. In more general terms, the JS was asked to consider how to track the risk profile of the Programme's portfolio. This was delivered via the establishment of a complex risk

matrix, which also encompasses the private partners.

- It was also agreed that the monitoring and evaluation process of the Programme should embrace the unintended effects, as part of the benefits management practice.

- The guidance provided in the Programme Manual for certain eligibility criteria allowed different levels of interpretation. This section of the Manual was revised after the first Monitoring Committee to ensure the full coherence of guidance provided to applicants.

(b) OPTIONAL FOR LIGHT REPORTS, otherwise it will be included in point 9.1. An assessment of whether progress made towards targets is sufficient to ensure their fulfilment, indicating any remedial actions taken or planned, where appropriate.

Despite the late approval of the NWE Programme in June 2015, the dynamics of the application process indicates that the Programme is likely to meet its 2018 milestones and 2022 targets. Even though the main challenge of the Programme in 2015 was the establishment of the initial project pipeline that would contribute to the Programme key implementation steps and indicator framework and stimulate the Programme spending profile, the process has successfully kicked off. Although this information does not relate to this reporting period, it must be noted that despite the low approval rates in the first call for proposals, the second call was fruitful in terms of number of applications approved in Step 1 (21 projects approved in Step 1). This demonstrates a better understanding of the thematic and technical requirements of the Programme amongst applicants, a better quality of the incoming projects as well as a higher approval rate.

To ensure the Programme meets its 2018 and 2022 milestones and targets, the Monitoring Committee proposed to perform an evaluation of the two-step approach to assess its effectiveness. The evaluation will be subject to a discussion at the May 2016 Monitoring Committee meeting.

6. CITIZEN'S SUMMARY (ARTICLE 50(9) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

A citizen's summary of the contents of the annual and the final implementation reports shall be made public and uploaded as a separate file in the form of annex to the annual and the final implementation report

You can upload/find the Citizen's summary under General > Documents

7. REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF FINANCIAL INSTRUMENTS (ARTICLE 46 OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

8. PROGRESS IN PREPARATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF MAJOR PROJECTS AND JOINT ACTION PLANS (ARTICLE 101(H) AND ARTICLE 111(3) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(3)(B) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)

8.1. Major projects

Table 7: Major projects

Project	CCI	Status of MP	Total investments	Total eligible costs	Planned notification/submission date	Date of tacit agreement/ approval by Commission	Planned start of implementation	Planned completion date	Priority Axis/ Investment priorities	Current state of realisation — financial progress (% of expenditure certified to Commission compared to total eligible cost)	Current state of realisation — physical progress Main implementation stage of the project	Main outputs	Date of signature of first works contract (1)	Observations

(1) In the case of operations implemented under PPP structures the signing of the PPP contract between the public body and the private sector body (Article 102(3) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013).

8.2. Joint action plans

Progress in the implementation of different stages of joint action plans

Table 8: Joint action plans (JAP)

Title of the JAP	CCI	Stage of implementation of JAP	Total eligible costs	Total public support	OP contribution to JAP	Priority axis	Type of JAP	[Planned] submission to the Commission	[Planned] start of implementation	[Planned] completion	Main outputs and results	Total eligible expenditure certified to the Commission	Observations

Significant problems encountered and measures taken to overcome them

9. ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)

9.1 Information in Part A and achieving the objectives of the programme (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Priority axis	1 - INNOVATION

Priority axis	2 - LOW CARBON

Priority axis	3 - RESOURCE AND MATERIALS EFFICIENCY

Priority axis	4 - TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

9.2. Specific actions taken to promote equality between men and women and to promote non-discrimination, in particular accessibility for persons with disabilities, and the arrangements implemented to ensure the integration of the gender perspective in the cooperation programme and operations (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 14(4), subparagraph 2, (d) of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013)

An assessment of the implementation of specific actions to take into account the principles set out in Article 7 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 on promotion of equality between men and women and non-discrimination, including, where relevant, depending on the content and objectives of the cooperation programme, an overview of specific actions taken to promote equality between men and women and to promote non-discrimination, including accessibility for persons with disabilities, and the arrangements implemented to ensure the integration of the gender perspective in the cooperation programme and operations

9.3.Sustainable development (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 14(4), subparagraph 2, (e) of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013)

An assessment of the implementation of actions to take into account the principles set out in Article 8 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 on sustainable development, including, where relevant, depending on the content and objectives of the cooperation programme, an overview of the actions taken to promote sustainable development in accordance with that Article

9.4. Reporting on support used for climate change objectives (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

9.5 Role of partners in the implementation of the cooperation programme (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 14(4), subparagraph 1, (c) of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013)

Assessment of the implementation of actions to take into account the role of partners referred to in Article 5 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013, including involvement of the partners in the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the cooperation programme

10. OBLIGATORY INFORMATION AND ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 1 (A) AND (B), OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013

10.1 Progress in implementation of the evaluation plan and the follow-up given to the findings of evaluations

10.2 The results of the information and publicity measures of the Funds carried out under the communication strategy

11. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION WHICH MAY BE ADDED DEPENDING ON THE CONTENT AND OBJECTIVES OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 2 (A), (B), (C) AND (F), OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)

11.1 Progress in implementation of the integrated approach to territorial development, including sustainable urban development, and community-led local development under the cooperation programme

11.2 Progress in implementation of actions to reinforce the capacity of authorities and beneficiaries to administer and to use the ERDF

11.3 Contribution to macro-regional and sea basin strategies (where appropriate)

11.4 Progress in the implementation of actions in the field of social innovation

13. SMART, SUSTAINABLE AND INCLUSIVE GROWTH

Information and assessment of the programme contribution to achieving the Union strategy for smart, sustainable and inclusive growth.

14. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN — PERFORMANCE FRAMEWORK (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

Where the assessment of progress made with regard to the milestones and targets set out in the performance framework demonstrates that certain milestones and targets have not been achieved, Member States should outline the underlying reasons for failure to achieve these milestones in the report of 2019 (for milestones) and in the final implementation report (for targets).

Documents

Document title	Document type	Document date	Local reference	Commission reference	Files	Sent date	Sent By
Annual Implementation Report, NWE	Report on the implementation of financial instruments	30-May-2016			Annual Implementation Report, NWE		
Citizen's summary	Citizens' summary	30-May-2016			Annual Implementation Report NWE Programme 2014-2015, Citizen's summary		